



Ethical Dilemma Competition

Overview

This is a chapter competition. In this competition, the chapter must debate an ethical education-related dilemma. This competition requires members to think deeply about an ethical issue, employ critical-thinking skills, and use persuasive communication techniques to collaboratively debate an ethical dilemma.

To participate, each member of the chapter must first thoroughly consider the ethical issue and begin to form an individual position on the topic. Then the chapter members must debate the topic together, listening carefully to each other's opinions. Through the discussion, the chapter members must come to a consensus on the topic and then prepare a 10-minute presentation stating their chapter's view.

The chapter must work as a team to develop the presentation and then select at least four and no more than eight students from the chapter to present the chapter's opinion and how it was reached to a panel of judges.

Four (4) entries total will be accepted. Entries will be accepted on a first-come, first-served basis and will be limited to the number of participants.



Ethical Dilemma Competition

Competition Guidelines

- A. The sponsoring teacher must submit the [Online Competition Entry Form](#) **by 5:00 pm on Friday, October 28, 2022.**
- B. During a chapter meeting, present the ethical dilemma narrative included at the end of this PDF.
- C. Spend adequate time discussing the dilemma. This deliberation may take several chapter meetings. As a group, answer the ethical dilemma questions listed with the ethical dilemma narrative included at the end of this PDF.
- D. When the discussions have concluded and a consensus has been reached, prepare a 10-minute live presentation stating the chapter's view on the dilemma.
- E. No fewer than four and no more than eight student representatives from competing chapters will participate in a 15-minute interactive session with a panel of judges. During the interactive session, the chapter representatives will deliver their live, 10-minute presentation to a panel of judges. The presentation should be a professional, clear, and decisive response to the dilemma. How the decision was reached and what factors were considered should be included in the presentation.
- F. Use of AV materials (ex. an original PowerPoint or Prezi presentation, short video, etc.) is permitted but entirely optional for the 10-minute presentation. The presentation file must be stored on a USB flash drive. There will not be an internet connection available in the meeting room.
- G. After the live presentation and for the balance of the 15-minute interactive session, the judges will ask the students questions about their deliberation process, the factors that were considered when making a decision, how they reached consensus, and other questions relevant to the deliberation process.
- H. One judge will also serve as timekeeper during the presentation. Chapter representatives will receive an indication that there is one minute remaining when they reach the nine-minute mark of their presentation

Judging and Scoring

- A. Competitors must be present at scheduled time or will be considered disqualified.
- B. The judges' decision is final.
- C. Competitors agree to be bound by the FEA General Competition Rules.
- D. The entry will be scored using the Ethical Dilemma Competition rubric.

How to Enter

- A. All entries for individual and/or chapter competitions must be submitted by the chapter's sponsoring teacher via the [Online Competition Entry Form](#) **by 5:00pm, October 28, 2022.**
- B. Entries submitted by email will not be accepted.
- C. Four (4) entries will be accepted for this competition. Entries will be accepted on a first-come, first-served basis.



Ethical Dilemma Competition

Ethical Dilemma Scenario

Mr. Hill is in his third year as a choir teacher at a small high school with an outstanding performing arts program. In fact, the high school's spring musical has become known as the cultural event of the year for the community.

The week before the spring musical is always frantic, as Mr. Hill spends hours coordinating with the band, theater, and art teachers about costumes, set design, stagehands, lighting and sound, parent volunteers, and ticket sales, never mind making sure students are prepared for the intense schedule of five performances in three days. Even though the school's principal made his position very clear that there should be no non-school related texting and phone calls between teachers and students, Mr. Hill feels that it's important to keep the line of communication with students open during these final weeks, even if it means they sometimes tell him about personal issues.

Issues always arise with students, especially right before production when they must juggle classes, work schedules, and family obligations with the strenuous demands of preparing for the performance, but students always seem to pull through. When students are feeling the stress, Mr. Hill has a knack for cultivating trust and building their confidence with his choir students through encouraging words, texts, and phone calls. After all, it wasn't that long ago that he was in their shoes!

But even Mr. Hill was not prepared for the late-night phone call from the production's lead actress and soloist just two days before opening night.

Mr. Hill had worked with Olivia for two years and considered himself a mentor – she had an outstanding voice, great acting skills, and a stage presence that was beyond what was typical for a high school sophomore. But she also struggled in school, and Mr. Hill suspected that she didn't have a strong relationship with her parents. He had heard rumors that her parents strongly disapproved of her boyfriend, a senior who had been in trouble a lot in school and was widely believed to be using drugs.

When Olivia called, she was sobbing uncontrollably.

"I made a big mistake – a really big mistake. But Mr. Hill, you must promise me that you will not tell anyone – I trust you more than anyone else at the school. I lied to my parents. Two weeks ago, I told them that I was spending the weekend at a friend's house to practice my lines – but actually I spent the weekend camping with my boyfriend in another state, more than 100 miles away.



Ethical Dilemma Competition

“My parents are furious at me. Not only am I grounded for the remainder of the school year, but my father told me I can’t be in the production this weekend! I know we really don’t have an understudy for my role – but I don’t know what to do. Mr. Hill, you have got to help me. Please help me! Will you please talk to my dad? He trusts you and I know he will listen to you.”

Mr. Hill is under pressure to make sure the musical goes off without a hitch. What steps should Mr. Hill take?

RECOMMENDED READING

Educators are often called upon to act as mentors to students, and many embrace the opportunity to have a meaningful role in the lives of their students outside the classroom. What are some possible unintended consequences of communicating with students outside of the school day? Read on for various perspectives:

The Model Code of Ethics for Educators

https://www.nasdtcc.net/page/MCEE_Doc

A Precarious Balance by Troy Hutchings

https://mpxfiles.mpxlive.com/Uploads/Files/live_2/pdk/bc87c6b5-08f8-4c56-8100-956c5c801b32.pdf?v=637649905285130000

You Went to College – Just Teach! by Troy Hutchings

<https://members.pdkintl.org/files/54ad0c29-786e-491c-9100-acb0e1e4e890.bin>

Texting Relationships between Students and Staff by Stephanie Jones

<https://my.aasa.org/AASA/Resources/SAMag/2020/Apr20/Legal.aspx>



Ethical Dilemma Competition

QUESTIONS TO CONSIDER DURING YOUR DEBATE OF THE DILEMMA

- What are some possible unintended consequences of communicating with students outside the school day?
- What potential problems exist for professional educators when they develop relationships with students outside their contracted roles? Is this common practice in other professions? How might issues related to conflict-of-interest, perceptions of bias, or even the unintended entanglement of emotions arise? While mentoring students is widely viewed as part of an educator's role, what safeguards can be put into place to protect the integrity of the teacher-student relationship?
- What obligations and responsibilities do educators have when they come into possession of information regarding a student's personal life? Is Mr. Hill acting as Olivia's teacher in this situation or her mentor? What are the implications for teachers when those roles become blurred?
- What competing tensions might Mr. Hill be facing regarding upholding his professional responsibility to produce an exemplary musical, and the request to intervene in Olivia's family's decisions, and any concerns he has for Olivia's well-being? How can educators best respond while maintaining their professional roles?
- How might this situation have been prevented – or could it have been prevented? How can teachers best prepare for the myriad unexpected situations that occur when working with students and their families?

Ethical Dilemma Competition

Presentation

Points Available	Accomplished 8 – 7	Commendable 6 – 5	Developing 4 – 3	Needs Improvement 2 – 1
Depth & Insight	The presentation reflects a deep and comprehensive understanding of multiple factors and points of view involved in the issue and succeeds in proposing compelling, well-founded paths forward.	The presentation reflects understanding of the issue and succeeds in proposing well-founded solutions for some but not all the issues in play in the scenario.	The presentation is on-topic. Responses offer multiple good points, but would benefit from more exploration, detail, or research. Solutions offered may only partially address the scenario.	The presentation reflects limited or flawed understanding of the issues in the scenario. Solutions offered are not plausible, appropriate, or justified.
Persuasiveness	The presenters are entirely persuasive with clear and well- founded rationales for their position.	The presenters make a commendable case but by leaving some areas not fully explored or explained, the presentation is not entirely persuasive.	The presenters should look for deeper or more clear and well- founded rationales for considering all aspects of the scenario and responding persuasively.	The presenters do not make a persuasive case for how to handle the situation professionally.
Teamwork & Professionalism	All aspects of the teams' performance — including demeanor, dress, speech, attention to detail, and quality of materials — reflects an equitable effort among all the members and a consistent high level of professionalism.	Most aspects of the team's performance — including demeanor, dress, speech, attention to detail, and quality of materials — reflects a mostly equitable effort among all the members and a commendable level of professionalism.	Aspects of the team's performance — including demeanor, dress, speech, attention to detail, and quality of materials — reflect mixed levels of professionalism. The responsibility load may appear imbalanced among team members	Multiple aspects of the competitors' performance — including demeanor, dress, speech, attention to detail, and quality of materials— need significant improvement to be considered professional caliber. The responsibility load appears highly imbalanced among team members.



Ethical Dilemma Competition

Presentation

Overall Impact	<p>The presentation's professional-caliber and highly persuasive exploration of the issues and explanation of decision points delivers maximum impact and understanding to the audience.</p> <p>The presentation content & delivery effectively complement each other to craft a highly impactful, professional-caliber experience.</p>	<p>The content and delivery work together to offer a commendable and persuasive presentation.</p> <p>With minor revisions and delivery tweaks, the project could be considered professional caliber.</p>	<p>The minimally persuasive presentation demonstrates effort. At multiple moments, the content and delivery may not effectively complement one another, or may reflect a partial lack of understanding or professional judgment. This may limit the impact of the presentation.</p>	<p>The unpersuasive presentation demonstrates inconsistent, unprofessional, or superficial aspects in content or delivery.</p> <p>The audience is frequently distracted from the intended impact by aspects of the content or delivery.</p>
----------------	---	--	---	---

Q&A

Points Available	Accomplished 4	Commendable 3	Developing 2	Needs Improvement 1
Responses	<p>The competitors' responses in the Q&A session demonstrate consistent thoughtfulness and professional-caliber insight, rooted in the deep experience of the material.</p> <p>The competitors display impressive, professional-level depth of knowledge and understanding given his/her experience and research.</p>	<p>The competitors' responses in the Q&A session demonstrate thoughtfulness and reflected successful attempts to address most of the material posed to him/her.</p> <p>The competitor displays some substantive knowledge and understanding of the selected topic based on his/her experience and research.</p>	<p>The competitors' responses in the Q&A session reflect a broad spectrum of levels of quality from answer to answer.</p>	<p>The competitors' responses in the Q&A session may reflect evident effort and passion, but are inconsistent in the depth, accuracy, understanding, or insight offered in responses.</p>